AP United States History
Sample Student Responses and Scoring Commentary

Inside:
☑ Short Answer Question 3
☑ Scoring Guideline
☑ Student Samples
☑ Scoring Commentary

© 2017 The College Board. College Board, Advanced Placement Program, AP, AP Central, and the acorn logo are registered trademarks of the College Board. Visit the College Board on the Web: www.collegeboard.org. AP Central is the official online home for the AP Program: apcentral.collegeboard.org
Using the two images, both by artist James Wales, answer (a), (b), and (c).

a) Briefly explain ONE historical perspective expressed by the artist about the changes from the period 1869–1877 to the period 1877–1881.

b) Briefly explain how ONE specific event or development led to a historical change suggested by the images.

c) Briefly explain ONE specific result in the period 1877–1900 of a historical change suggested by the images.

Scoring Guide

0–3 points

Score 3
Response accomplishes all three tasks set by the question.

Score 2
Response accomplishes two of the tasks set by the question.

Score 1
Response accomplishes one of the tasks set by the question.

Score 0
Response accomplishes none of the tasks set by the question.
Score NR
No response. Response is completely blank.

Introduction

The cartoons

- The artist, in the left image, depicts the South in the post-Civil War era as victimized by carpetbaggers, military rule, and a federal government exceeding its authority; the northern-dominated government is portrayed as vindictive and arrogant, more interested in punishment than in true reconstruction.
  - The image includes the large number of weapons, the presence of Union soldiers, and the bag depicting Union government on the back of a white woman labelled “The Solid South” and chained to the two Union soldiers.
  - A burned-out farm and a sinking ship also appear in the background in the upper right.
  - President Ulysses S. Grant, as representative of the arrogant federal government, rides atop the carpet bag.
- The artist, in the right image, depicts the changed South as prospering and productive without federal control and better off economically and socially if left alone.
  - The image includes President Rutherford B. Hayes, as representative of the federal government after the Compromise of 1877, in the foreground plowing a furrow using a plough fashioned from rifles and swords. The plough is labelled “Let ’Em Alone Policy.”
  - A bloody shirt (a symbol for the Civil War) is being buried alongside other tools for war.
  - African Americans are depicted as once again working in fields, picking cotton, and moving bales of cotton.
  - The background shows prosperous farms, trade, and shipping.

Scoring Notes

a) Response briefly explains ONE historical perspective expressed by the artist about the changes from the period 1869–1877 to the period 1877–1881.

NOTE: It is acceptable for test-takers to explain the historical perspective expressed by the artist without reference to specific cartoons.

Examples of responses to (a) that would earn the point:
The South is portrayed as victimized from 1869–1877, and the South is portrayed as prospering and productive from 1877-1881.

- Evidence for victimized South (1869-1877) could include but is not limited to:
  - North/Government: carpetbaggers, military occupation (bayonet rule), federal government exceeding its authority, a vindictive northern-dominated government as a result of the Civil War seeking to punish the South.
  - South: oppression (bent over and chained white woman), agricultural collapse (burned-out farm), economic ruin (sinking ship).

OR

- Evidence for a prospering and productive South (1877-1881) could include but is not limited to:
  - North/Government: Compromise of 1877 resulting in “Let ’Em Alone Policy” as end of federal control, withdrawal of federal troops (rifles and sword turned into plough), end of Civil War vindictiveness (bayonet rule and bloody shirt buried).
  - South: better off economically and socially (prospering farms, trade, shipping), African Americans depicted as once again working in fields.
b) Response briefly explains how ONE specific event or development led to a historical change suggested by the images.

Examples of responses to (b) that would earn the point:

- Opposition to Reconstruction policies
- Violence against former slaves and Reconstruction-era political leaders (both white and black) in the South by organizations such as the Ku Klux Klan
- The emergence of Redeemer governments in the South and the removal of military occupation
- The Compromise of 1877
- The weakening resolve of the northern public and politicians
- Migration into or out of South: African Americans leaving the South (Exodusters 1879), Chinese coming to South as farm laborers, Northern whites moving to the South
- The emergence of sharecropping in the South as a new form of servitude for African Americans

c) Response briefly explains ONE specific result in the period 1877–1900 of a historical change suggested by the images.

Examples of responses to (c) that would earn the point:

- Economics
  - The agricultural and industrial recovery of the New South (e.g., sharecropping, tenant farming, steel factories, textile mills)
  - The continued impoverishment of the South (e.g., white southerners’ continued poverty, economic productivity, and standard of living declined after the war)

- Politics
  - End of Radical Reconstruction
  - Decline of Republican Party in the South
  - Shift to Redeemer (Democratic) government in Southern states
  - Rise of Populist Party and popularity in South/agrarian reform for Southern white and African American farmers

- Race relations
  - The rise of racial violence and legal segregation (Jim Crow laws, *Plessy v. Ferguson*)
  - The disfranchisement of African Americans
  - The lack of enforcement of the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments
  - The system of slavery replaced by sharecropping, which offered some independence but kept many former slaves indebted, impoverished, and bound to the land
Write your answer to SHORT-ANSWER QUESTION 3 on this page only.

3a. The artist believes that in the period from 1869–1877, the Reconstruction Acts led to carpetbaggers and scalawags exercising immense military rule over the Solid South. In the period from 1877–1881, reconstruction no longer took place to the same extent as from 1869–1877, which allowed white farmers and plantation owners to exploit the labor of African Americans. The military commanders who enforced Reconstruction were no longer present in the South from 1877–1881.

3b. The change in the images was caused by the Compromise of 1877. The election between the Republican Rutherford B. Hayes and the Democratic Samuel Tilden was very close and depended on the outcome of disputed votes in a few states in the South. The Democrats agreed to conceding victory to Hayes if Reconstruction ended and military commanders in the South were removed.

3c. From 1877–1900, Jim Crow laws became more common because Reconstruction had ended with the Compromise of 1877. Jim Crow laws were discriminatory and subjected African Americans to inferior positions through poll taxes, literacy tests, etc. Similarly, the sharecropping system was used to exploit the blacks for farm labor and subjected them to a cycle of poverty and debt, often serving former masters.
Write your answer to SHORT-ANSWER QUESTION 3 on this page only.

a. The artist shows that there was a huge change in how to deal with the South between the administrations of Grant and Hayes. One perspective shown is the discontinuation of the occupation of federal troops in the South, as the artist shows "Bayonet Rule" being covered up by the "Let'em Alone Policy." 

b. The election of 1876 was a close one that almost saw Hayes lose to a Democrat. In order to keep the South happy, a compromise was made that would lead to the end of federal occupation in the South, a Democrat would be on the President's cabinet, and funding for infrastructure in the South would be provided.

c. With the "bloody shirt" being buried and forgotten, politicians stopped blaming the South for the civil war in order to push their political agendas.
2. One historical perspective expressed by the artist is that a change occurred in the periods 1869-1881. The government changed from involved and powerful to "hands off" regarding economics/businesses and their regulation.

b. The Civil War as well as the presidents of the era contributed to the Laissez Fair or hands off government approach. The failure of reconstruction and postwar presidents rarely got involved in regulation of businesses, creating a weak government as shown by the "let 'em alone".

c. One result of this "hands off" government regulation was that monopolies and trusts began to form. This period was called the "Gilded Age" for a reason because under a seemingly prosperous nation (development of businesses such as oil and steel) lay corrupt roots. Political bosses such as Boss Tweed emerged and companies consolidated to form trusts and put smaller companies out of business.
Overview

Responses were expected to demonstrate a recognition that the James Wales two-panel cartoon depicted a perspective that Reconstruction had failed and that the South revived after 1877. Responses were also expected to recognize the image’s representation either of the South’s oppression from 1869 to 1877 or its revitalization after the end of Reconstruction from 1877 to 1881. Successful responses examined the cause and effect of policies and actions suggested in the image. First, they explained how a specific event or development led to a change either during Reconstruction or after its end. Second, they explained a result in the post-Reconstruction South (1877–1900) of a historical change implied by the images. The question did not require in-depth analysis of cartoon elements, as the “suggested by the images” question language made clear.

Responses were expected to include, for example, discussion of carpetbaggers and an interventionist federal presence (“Strong” government), military occupation and its end (bayonet rule and bloody shirt being buried), the role of the Compromise of 1877 in the withdrawal of federal troops, the diminished Northern resolve (“Weak” government), the emergence of sharecropping as a labor system to replace slavery, racial violence, the entrenchment of Jim Crow segregation, the disfranchisement of African Americans with the absence of federal troops, or the lack of enforcement of the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments.

This question assessed the skill of Causation.

The Learning Objective assessed in this question focuses on American and national identity (explaining how interpretations of the Constitution and debates over rights, liberties, and definitions of citizenship have affected American values, politics, and society).

Sample: 3A
Score: 3

a) The response earned 1 point because it identifies the artist’s perspective on the transition between the two time frames and explains it using the following evidence: “carpetbaggers” and “military rule” in response to Southerners’ exploitation of African American labor again as the “military commanders who enforced Reconstruction were no longer present in the South.”

b) The response earned 1 point because it correctly identifies the election of Rutherford B. Hayes as the event that led to change. The response includes accurate information about Samuel Tilden, the disputed votes, and the removal of troops as part of the compromise reached between the two candidates.

c) The response earned 1 point as it identifies multiple factors (the emergence of Jim Crow laws and sharecropping) resulting in the subjugation of African Americans “because Reconstruction had ended with the Compromise of 1877.”

Sample: 3B
Score: 2

a) The response earned 1 point because it accurately identified the artist’s perspective and explained the change from the military occupation of the South under the Grant administration to the “‘Let ‘em Alone Policy’” of Hayes.
b) The response earned 1 point because it accurately explained how Hayes’s victory in the election of 1876 led to the end of Reconstruction.

c) The response earned 0 points because of its undeveloped explanation of the decline of “‘bloody shirt’” rhetoric.

Sample: 3C
Score: 1

a) The response earned 0 points because, while it identifies a historical perspective of change, there was no explanation.

b) The response earned 1 point because it identifies “the failure of reconstruction” as a cause leading to the “‘let ’em alone’” policy.

c) The response earned 0 points because it describes events of the Gilded Age that are not referenced in either image.