Question 2

Evaluate the extent to which the ratification of the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments to the Constitution marked a turning point in the history of United States politics and society.

In the development of your argument, explain what changed and what stayed the same from the period immediately before the amendments to the period immediately following them. (*Historical thinking skill: Periodization*)

Maximum Possible Points: 6

Please note:
- Each point of the rubric is earned independently, e.g., a student could earn the point for synthesis without earning the point for thesis.
- Unique evidence from the student response is required to earn each point, e.g., evidence in the student response that qualifies for either of the targeted skill points, could not be used to earn the point for thesis.

A. Thesis (1 point)
   Targeted Skill: Argumentation (E1)

   1 point  Presents a thesis that makes a historically defensible claim and responds to all parts of the question. The thesis must consist of one or more sentences located in one place, either in the introduction or the conclusion.

   0 points  Does not present a thesis that makes a historically defensible claim and responds to all parts of the question.

   --  Is completely blank.

B. Argument Development: Using the Targeted Historical Thinking Skill (2 points)
   Targeted Skill: Argumentation (E2 and E3) and Periodization (D6)

PERIODIZATION:

1 point  Describes the ways in which the historical development specified in the prompt was different from OR similar to developments that preceded AND followed.

1 point  Explains the extent to which the historical development specified in the prompt was different from AND similar to developments that preceded AND followed.

0 points  Does not describe the ways in which the historical development specified in the prompt was different from and similar to developments that preceded AND followed.

--  Is completely blank.
Scoring Note: For both points, if the prompt requires evaluation of a turning point, then responses must discuss developments that preceded AND followed. For both points, if the prompt requires evaluation of the characteristics of an era, then responses can discuss developments that EITHER preceded OR followed.

C. Argument Development: Using Evidence (2 points)
Targeted Skill: Argumentation (E2 and E3)

1 point Addresses the topic of the question with specific examples of relevant evidence.

1 point Utilizes specific examples of evidence to fully and effectively substantiate the stated thesis or a relevant argument.

0 points Does not address the topic of the question with specific examples of relevant evidence.

-- Is completely blank.

Scoring Note: To fully and effectively substantiate the stated thesis or a relevant argument, responses must include a broad range of evidence that, through analysis and explanation, justifies the stated thesis or a relevant argument.

D. Synthesis (1 point)
Targeted Skill: Synthesis (C4 or C5)

a) 1 point Extends the argument by explaining the connections between the argument and ONE of the following: A development in a different historical period, situation, era, or geographical area

b) A course theme and/or approach to history that is not the focus of the essay (such as political, economic, social, cultural, or intellectual history)

0 points Does not extend the argument by explaining the connections between the argument and the other areas listed.

-- Is completely blank.

Scoring Note: The synthesis point requires an explanation of the connections to different historical period, situation, era, or geographical area, and is not awarded for merely a phrase or reference.

On Accuracy: The components of this rubric each require that students demonstrate historically defensible content knowledge. Given the timed nature of the exam, the essay may contain errors that do not detract from the overall quality, as long as the historical content used to advance the argument is accurate.

On Clarity: These essays should be considered first drafts and thus may contain grammatical errors. Those errors will not be counted against a student unless they obscure the successful demonstration of the content knowledge and skills described above.
AP® UNITED STATES HISTORY
2016 SCORING GUIDELINES

Question 2 (continued)

Scoring Notes

Note: Test-taker responses define the chronological beginning and end points for the essay; the focus of the response helps determine what information is considered appropriate.

Note: Student samples are quoted verbatim and may contain grammatical errors.

A. Thesis (1 point)

Responses earn one point by presenting a thesis that makes a historically defensible claim that responds to all parts of the question (1 point). While the thesis does not need to be a single sentence, it does need to be discrete, meaning it cannot be pieced together from across multiple places within the essay. It can be located in either the introduction or the conclusion, but not split between the two.

An acceptable thesis would evaluate the extent to which the ratification of the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments was a turning point, indicating the extent of change OR continuity. Note: Indicating explicitly the extent of change implies the extent of continuity, and vice versa.

Examples of acceptable theses:

- “The ratification of the Fourteenth and Fifteenth amendments marked a minimal turning point in the way African Americans were viewed, and not much in the way they were treated, as well as a minimal political shift due to African American influence in politics.”
- “The 14 and 15 amendments did not mark a turning point due to the fact other legislation and Supreme court cases brought back the discrimination the amendments sought to take away.”

Unacceptable example of thesis:

- “These two [amendments] caused a turning point by ensuring a better life for African Americans, for the American people as a whole and for the over-all attitude of the people of the U.S.”
  o The response does not address the major points of the question — how the ratification marks a major turning point for the United States politics and society. Additionally, it does not make a historically defensible claim about the impact of the amendments.

B. Argument Development: Using The Targeted Historical Thinking Skill (2 points)

a) Argument Development — Describes

Responses earn one point by describing the ways in which relevant historical developments were different from OR similar to developments that preceded AND followed the ratification of the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments (1 point).

Example of acceptable description of a turning point:

- “This included allowing blacks to vote which ultimately led to President Grant’s victory in the elections. The prosperity of the freedman increased by the Freedman’s Bureau that advocated equality in education and ownership in land. However, once the compromise of the next election occurred and ended reconstruction, the reforms of equality between races began to decline. Regardless, the Fourteen and Fifteenth amendment was still in effect; even though the poll taxes and grandfather clause restricted many blacks from voting and achieving full equality. . . .”
Example of unacceptable description of a turning point:

- “Giving African Americans the right to vote led to the rise and creation of the Ku Klux Klan. During Ulysses [sic] S. Grant presidency. It was a majority of black votes that [got] him into office. The KKK didn’t like this new amendment, so they would use scare tactics, such as burning churches and burning African American homes, to scare black people from voting. Grant took action and forced the KKK to stop the hatred against his African American voters.”
  
  o The response strictly focuses on what follows the Fifteenth Amendment and does not address the preceding time period.

b) Argument Development — Explains

Responses can earn the point by explaining the extent to which the circumstances surrounding the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments were different from AND similar to developments that preceded and followed them (1 point).

Example of acceptable explanation of the extent of differences and similarities:

- “The Fourteenth amendment eliminated the debate that existed under the Dred Scott decision as African Americans were now citizens and had the right to sue in court. The Fourteenth amendment opened doors for African Americans as seen in . . . Board v. Board of Ed court case. If it were not for the Fourteenth amendment this court case would have never existed . . . Prior to the Fifteenth amendment, only white men could vote, so the Fifteenth allowed African Americans to voice their concerns to society through the power to vote. However, this amendment also marked the beginning of voting restrictions such as poll taxes and literacy tests in southern states where racist sentiment continued to exist. Politics in the south would still restrict African Americans however, these restrictions set the stage for the future in legislation such as voting rights in the 1960’s which abolished literacy tests.”

Example of unacceptable explanation of the extent of differences and similarities:

- “During the Reconstruction Era, African Americans have advanced their position politically for some obtained political positions that their predecessors have never done before. This, to an extent, increased the voice in politics and decision-making process. However, most of the Southerners were still not over the idea that white people were better than black; in other words: white supremacy still permeated throughout the South, and they were not about to react kindly to these new amendments.”
  
  o This excerpt meets the standard for describing differences and similarities but is not as thorough as the previous example in explaining the extent, so it would earn only one point.

C. Argument Development: Using Evidence (2 points)

a) Using Evidence — Examples

Responses can earn one point by addressing the topic of the question by referring to specific examples or relevant evidence (1 point). Essays can earn this point without having a stated thesis or a relevant argument.
Examples of specific evidence that could be used to address the topic of the question:

- Three-Fifths Clause/Compromise (1787)
- *Dred Scott v. Sandford* (1857)
- Abraham Lincoln
- Emancipation Proclamation (1863)
- Thirteenth Amendment (1865)
- Civil War
- Black Codes
- Freedmen’s Bureau — 40 acres and a mule
- Andrew Johnson’s Reconstruction Plan — encouraged states to consider giving African Americans voting rights
- Civil Rights Act (1866) — direct response to Black Codes and the Dred Scott decision
- Ku Klux Klan/ Knights of the White Camelia/Red Shirts and White League
- Reconstruction Act (1867)
- Jim Crow
- President Ulysses Grant
- Poll taxes/Grandfather clause/Literacy tests
- Ku Klux Klan Act/Enforcement Acts (1870 and 1871)Colfax, LA (1873) — mob of whites attacked a group of black Republicans
- Civil Rights Act of 1875
- *Plessy v. Ferguson* (1896)
- Radical Republicans
- Redemption/Redeemers or “Bourbons”
- Thaddeus Stevens
- Charles Sumner
- De facto/de jure segregation
- New South — led to mill towns where African Americans and white people came into close contact

Examples of unsuccessfully using evidence to address the topic of the question:

- Evidence that is factually incorrect, confused about chronology, or not directly relevant to the question.
  - “Abraham Lincoln helped the enslaved to be free with his creation of the emancipation proclamation which freed all slaves so Lincoln was an abolitionist which were those against Slavery. Also a known person for helping freeing slaves was Harriet Tubman she was in charge of an underground railroad that help lead the slaves escape and free on their own. Tubman escaped herself because she too was a slave so she saw her opportunity and took a chance.”

b) Using Evidence — Effective Substantiation

Responses earn a separate point by utilizing specific examples of evidence to fully and effectively substantiate a thesis or relevant argument about how the ratification of the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments to the Constitution marked a turning point in the history of United States politics and society.
Question 2 (continued)

Fully and effectively substantiating the thesis goes beyond merely providing many examples. This point is earned by clearly and consistently linking significant evidence to the argument and showing how the evidence demonstrates how the ratification of the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments to the Constitution marked a turning point in the history of United States politics and society (1 point).

Examples of evidence that could be utilized to substantiate an argument:

Points arguing the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments marked a turning point could include the following:

- African Americans gained suffrage and equal protection under the law for the first time.
- African Americans participated in the political process during Reconstruction.
  - majority of eligible African Americans registered to vote; sharp increase in black voting
  - 2,000 black politicians elected to public office during Reconstruction
  - two served in U.S. Senate — Hiram Revels and Blanche K. Bruce, both from Mississippi
    [since then, only seven African Americans have held seats in the Senate]
  - Union League
- New state constitutions expanded public responsibilities — especially state-funded systems of free public education.
- The women’s rights movement split over the question of African American suffrage.
- The Fourteenth Amendment gave African Americans legal standing in courts.
- The Fourteenth Amendment overturned the Black Codes.
- The Supreme Court has applied the Fourteenth Amendment to critical court cases in the 20th century (Brown v. Board of Education of Topeka, Roe v. Wade, and Loving v. Virginia).
- The Fourteenth Amendment provides due process under law.
- The Fourteenth Amendment gave Southern states more representation in the House of Representatives (previously African American slaves were counted as three-fifths of a person).
- The Fourteenth Amendment also protected other racial groups such as Chinese-Americans and gave them equal protection under the law.
  - U.S. v. Wong Kim Ark (1898) — the Court ruled the Fourteenth Amendment awarded citizenship to children of Chinese immigrants born on American soil.
- Former slaves expressed their new status
  - Chose new names; changed style of dress.
  - Able to travel without a pass ending the “patrollers” who had enforced the “pass system.”
  - Conducted religious services without white supervision; consequently churches became social institutions that African Americans controlled.
- Religious denominations that grew
  - African Methodist Episcopal
  - African Methodist Episcopal Zion
  - Ministers became key leaders within developing African American communities
- Black newspapers
Points arguing the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments DID NOT mark a turning point could include the following:

- Free African Americans in the North had previously been stripped of their rights to vote.
  - 1821 New York Constitution added property qualifications for blacks that were so high that almost all were stripped of the franchise
  - 1838 Pennsylvania Constitution stripped of the vote; black leaders protested
- Reconstruction politics were almost entirely in white hands; few black politicians elected in the South after Reconstruction ended.
- Myths of Old South and Lost Cause.
- African Americans in the South are disenfranchised through poll taxes, literacy test, voter intimidation, and violence at polls.
  - laws to disenfranchise black males: poll tax (or some form of property qualification) or the “literacy” or “understanding” test (required voters to demonstrate an ability to read and interpret the Constitution)
- Lynching, Ku Klux Klan, violence, and intimidation prevent blacks from exercising their legal rights until the Civil Rights movement in the 20th century
- Split in women’s rights movement arguably weakened the movement and delayed woman suffrage.
  - Fourteenth Amendment only penalizing a state for denying a group of men the right to vote.
  - Fifteenth Amendment outlawed discrimination in voting based on race, but not gender.
  - First time the word “male” was introduced into the Constitution in connection with voting rights.
  - 1873 NAWSA members tried to register to vote — to test the new amendments.
    - *Minor v. Happersett* (1875) — suffrage rights were not inherent in citizenship; women were citizens, but state legislatures could deny women the vote if they wished
- Few black politicians elected in the South after Reconstruction ended.
- Federal government ignored gross violations of the equal protection clause until the Civil Rights movement.
  - *Slaughterhouse Cases* (1873)
  - *United States v. Cruikshank* (1876) and *United States v. Reese* (1876)
  - *Hall v. DeCuir* (1878)
  - *Civil Rights Cases* (1883)
- Supreme Court upheld Jim Crow laws legalizing segregation in the South in *Plessy v. Ferguson*.
  - *Plessy v. Ferguson* (1896)
  - *Cumming v. County Board of Education* (1899)
- Sharecropping/crop lien system/tenant farming.
  - No land distribution
- NAACP (est. 1910) struggled for enforcement of the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments.
  - *Guinn v. U.S.* (1915)
  - *Buchanan v. Warley* (1917)
Example of utilizing evidence to substantiate an argument:
- “Racist groups such as the Ku Klux Klan, led by Nathan Forrest used violence to threaten and intimidate African Americans from exercising their new rights.”

Examples of unsuccessfully attempting to substantiate an argument with evidence:
- “Plessy v. Ferguson outlined the state of blacks and whites together as “separate but equal.”
  - While the information is correct, it does not address the Court’s upholding the constitutionality of segregation.
- “Laws also required literacy tests in order to vote. Most African Americans were not educated and were therefore unable to vote.”
  - Very simplistic and does not develop the impact of literacy tests fully.

D. Synthesis (1 point)

Essays earn a point for synthesis by extending their argument in one of two possible ways (1 point).

a) Responses can extend their argument by explaining the connections between their argument and a development in a different historical period, situation, era, or geographical area (Synthesis proficiency C4). These connections must consist of more than just a phrase or reference.

Possible connections could include the following:
- Explicitly linking the discussion to the long-term impacts of the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments in the 20th century, such as the judicial revolution under the Warren Court
- Explicitly linking the amendments to major civil rights laws such as the Voting Rights Act of 1965

Examples of synthesis by connecting the argument to a development in a different historical period, situation, era, or geographical area:
- “The Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments were a sign of a new era in American society and politics, but were not enough to get the country to its destination. Nearly one hundred years after the Civil War, the 1954 decision in Brown v. Board of Ed of Topeka ended the legality of Jim Crow segregation, and ten years later the Civil Rights Act of 1964 made equality mostly present. The Voting Rights Act of 1965 further solidified the promises from those two amendments. Thus, the Fourteenth and Fifteenth amendments were crucial as a step in the right direction, but largely failed in immediately changing the political and social culture of the United States.”
- “Much like the ratification of the 14th and 15th amendments was the ratification of the 19th amendment in 1920. This amendment gave suffrage to women and created significant social and political changes in the decade that followed. As women were given the right to vote, they gained political influence, much like the African Americans who gained the right to vote. Furthermore, they helped to usher in a new social era that gravitated towards wealth and success and a more liberal sentiment in America. The passage of the 14th and 15th amendments as well as the 19th amendment had significant impacts on the political and social climate of the United States, but also reflected some continuity as both groups continued to face discrimination in some ways.”
Example that did not accurately connect the argument to a development in a different historical period, situation, era, or geographical area:

- “The intimidation methods of freed African Americans is much like the Palmer Raids during the Red Scare because entities like HUAC intimidated workers who wanted to form unions, as did entities like the Ku Klux Klan to African Americans who wanted to exercise their rights.”
  - This is a confused attempt to link the methods used by the KKK to intimidate African Americans to the Palmer Raids and the HUAC. It does not clearly extend the argument to make a connection to a different historical time period.

b) Responses can extend their argument by explaining the connections between their argument and a course theme and/or approach to history that is not the focus of the essay, such as political, economic, social, cultural, or intellectual history (Synthesis proficiency C5). These connections must consist of more than just a phrase or reference. Possible connections could include explicitly calling out the international aspects of a largely domestic story.

Example of synthesis by connecting the argument to a different course theme or approach to history:

- “The treatment of African Americans after the passing of the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendment is similar to that of the Native Americans who were constantly promised that if they were to relocate to another area then there could be no interruption from settlers again. This constantly broken promise is similar to the constantly broken promise to freed blacks that they are citizens and have unalienable rights when in fact they are not given.”

Example that did not accurately connect the argument to a different course theme or approach to history:

- “Identity connects by making most Americans seem equal in “identity” and have their own name for themselves. These groups were brought closer to what it means to be an American and their opportunities skyrocketed from there on.”
  - This does not extend the argument by explaining the connection between the argument and another course theme.
The role of African Americans in the US has been crucial to every period of American history. For over a hundred years they had been enslaved, and disagreements over slavery culminated in the US's bloodiest war. When the Union won, three Amendments were passed which changed the lives of black people nationwide: the 13th, 14th, and 15th Amendments. They respectively ended slavery and made all citizens equal under the law regardless of color, and gave blacks the right to vote. And while the latter two did certainly have a huge impact on American politics and society, it was not as momentous as it would seem.

Before the passage of the Amendments, blacks had almost nothing in the eyes of the law. They were not afforded the same rights as white people such as due process, voting, and other guarantees and freedom. The two amendments changed that, by putting blacks on equal status with whites in the eyes of the law. Any black citizen could own property, run for office, and cast a ballot in an election. Subsequently, the number of black representatives in local, state, and federal governments rose, and African Americans gained a voice in legislature.
For the short time being, they were not at the
hands of the oppressive whites who used to rule
over them. Blacks were legally equal
to whites in every sense following the 14th and 15th
Amendments.

However, that equality was not in the eyes
of the people, and thus the Amendments were not
so successful. When Reconstruction ended in 1877,
whites began to take back the Southern governments.
Soon all sorts of discrimination were passed. Poll taxes and grandfather clauses were
used to suppress the votes of blacks. Segregation
under the guise of Separate but Equal and
established constitutionally invalid by
Plessy v. Ferguson in the 1890s, wiped much of the
equality gained from the 14th Amendment. Blacks became
relegated to being second-class citizens, deprived
of the assurances these Amendments guaranteed.
African American representatives became virtually
absent in most parts of the country, and
for a half century discrimination endured and
even thrived. In this way, the 14th and 15th Amendments
had importance in mostly only name and symbolism.
They were like empty words, and the sharecroppers
in the 1880s became not too distinguished from
the slaves in the 1850s.
The 14th and 15th Amendments were a sign of a new era in American society and politics, but were not enough to get the country to its destination. Nearly one hundred years after the Civil War, the 1954 decision in Brown v. Board of Ed of Topeka ended the legality of Jim Crow segregation, and ten years later the Civil Rights Act of 1964 made equality mostly present. The Voting Rights Act of 1965 further solidified the promises from those two amendments. Thus, the 14th and 15th amendments were crucial as a step in the right direction, but largely failed in immediately changing the cultural, political, and social culture of the United States.

This legality was never before seen in the history of America.

The concept of 40 Acres and a Mule gave new economic opportunities to African Americans, and the Freedman's Bureau gave them support needed to establish independent lives. Blacks also received more formal education, giving them a closer level to whites.
The ratification of the 14th and 15th amendments revolutionized the lives of African Americans in the United States. These amendments granted former slaves citizenship and voting rights that they had never experienced as Americans.

These two amendments marked a major change from the unequal treatment and discrimination that existed under the law prior to the Civil War. These 2 amendments were ratified during the Reconstruction period following the Civil War, and demonstrated a victory for abolitionists and loss for Southern slave owners. The 14th and 15th amendments forever changed the dynamics of American society. Regardless of the region a person lived in and treated Resolutionized the lives of African Americans.

The 14th amendment of the Constitution increased drastically increased. The ratification of the 14th and 15th amendment marked a turning point in a major change in the way American society accepted African Americans and put the forefront for future advancements for African Americans.

The 14th amendment forever changed the United States as it granted
Citizenship to former slaves and the rights of citizenship equally protected under the law. In the early 1800's a law like this would have been fiercely debated by slave owners and abolitionists. However, since the Union had won the Civil War, the country could proceed to progress and eliminate slavery in America. The 14th amendment eliminated the debate that existed under the Dred Scott decision as African Americans were now citizens and had the right to sue in court. The 14th amendment opened doors for African Americans as seen in the Plessy v. Ferguson case and Brown v. Board of Education court cases. If it were not for the 14th amendment, these court cases would have never existed.

The 15th amendment enfranchised African Americans, for the first time, blacks could participate in the political process and vote for leaders who represented their interests. Prior to the 15th amendment, only white men could vote, so the 15th altered African Americans to voice their concerns to solve through the power to vote. However, this
amendment also marked the beginning of voting restrictions such as poll taxes and literacy tests in southern states where racial sentiment continued to exist. Politics in the South became as rigid and still restrict African Americans, however, set those restrictions set the stage for true justice in legislation such as the voting rights act in the 1960's which abolished literacy tests. Despite southern hostilities, if the 15th amendment hadn't been passed, African Americans would have never had the opportunity to gain political freedom in America.

Furthermore, the 14th and 15th amendments marked a change in civil rights for African Americans. These two amendments began were the start of government intervention in discrimination against blacks which would be seen in the civil rights movement of the 1960's. Civil rights leaders like Martin Luther King, Malcolm X, and Shirley Chisholm would go on to reference the 14th and 15th amendments in their arguments for civil rights in the 1960's. These two amendments
guaranteed certain freedoms in black acts and allowed for rights to be extended in future de cades.

Even though the 14th and 15th amendments established the lives of African Americans, they also served as proof that triggered the Jim Crow laws in Southern states which restricted African Americans despite their rights. These Jim Crow laws existed throughout Reconstruction until the 1960s and demonstrated the remainder of anti-black sentiment despite the assertion earned rights by the law. The 14th and 15th amendments revolution for uses at African Americans in terms of the political process and future improvements to civil conditions of African Americans in the 1960s. People institutions like the Jim Crow laws, the 14th and 15th amendments, opened doors for African Americans in ways that at weighed the requires of the Jim Crow laws. Not only did they immediately improve the lives of African Americans when they were passed, but they also set a precedent for future civil
Circle the question number that you are answering on this page.

Mandatory

1

Circle one

2 or 3

Right movements that expanded upon what they had initially accomplished.
The United States promotes its democratic equality through its legislation and existence. However, it was not until the 1970s that the minority of the United States finally got a voice within the legislation of the United States. Even with powerful opposition, the ratification of the Fourteenth and Fifteenth amendments to the Constitution marked a turning point in United States politics and society.

Before the Civil War era and the reconstruction era, when the amendments were passed, politics were dominated by Anglo-Saxons. Not only were blacks not seen as equals or had the right to vote, they were enslaved or spared discrimination against. In the court case of Plessy v. Ferguson, the Supreme Court led by Judge, Taunton ruled that blacks were not only not people but property. Blacks were seen as inferior beings for they were barred from education by legislation from the Southern states such as South Carolina. As early as the thirteen colonies, blacks were made inferior and subjected to white control by laws in Maryland and Virginia that stated that blacks born into slavery were to remain slaves and they could never move outside of their race.
After the civil war and reconstruction began with the ratification of the amendments of 13, 14, and 15. Slavery were not only freed but given equal rights and suffrage as well. With the promation of the northern government, blacks established committees and schools prospered, and blacks even held offices. With the northern guard in place along with the carpetbaggers, the south was forced to comply with the unions demands. This included allowing blacks to vote which ultimately led to the president Grant's victory in the elections. The prosperity of the freedman were increased by the Freedman's Bureau that advocated equality in education and ownership of land. However once the compromise of the next election occurred the reforms of equality between races began to decline. Regardless the Fourteenth and Fifteenth amendment was still in affect. Even though the poll taxes and the grand father clause restricted many blacks from voting and achieving full equality, it was still an amendment that would live to continue to establish equality in the decades to come.

Minorities in the current era play a major role in politics. The affect of the fourteenth and fifteenth amendments can be seen today as the current president of two terms is black. The white majority must now address the minority's involunts in
order to stay in office. These current arrangements in politics began with the ratification of the fourteenth and fifteenth amendments, a turning point in American politics and society with lasting effects.
Long Essay Question 2

Note: Student samples are quoted verbatim and may contain grammatical or other errors.

Overview

This question allowed students to evaluate the extent to which the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments marked a turning point in the history of United States politics and society, explaining what changed and what stayed the same from the period immediately before the amendments to the period immediately following them. The question assessed the historical thinking skill of periodization and covered Period 5, which ranges from 1844 to 1877, and Period 6, which ranges from 1865 to 1898.

Sample: 2A

Score: 6

A. Thesis: 1 point

The thesis delineates the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments and takes a position that the impact was “not as momentous as it would seem.” The thesis addresses topics of political change (gave Black people the right to vote) and social change (made all citizens equal under the law regardless of color). The thesis responds to all parts of the question.

B. Argument Development: Using the Targeted Historical Thinking Skill: 2 points

a) Argument Development — Describes: 1 point
This response discusses developments that both preceded and followed the ratification of the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments and includes both differences and similarities. The difference between the period before the amendments — with the lack of due process and guarantees of other freedoms — and the period after with Black people’s ability to own property, run for office, and cast ballots is clearly described.

b) Argument Development — Explains: 1 point
The response also mentions that de jure discrimination was similar in both periods and that the sharecroppers of the 1860s were not very different from the slaves of the 1850s. There is some imbalance between before and after, but the response provides a great deal of explanation and analysis of the extent to which the amendments were a turning point.

C. Argument Development: Using Evidence: 2 points

a) Using Evidence — Examples: 1 point
This response uses relevant evidence to explain why the impact on the amendments was not a momentous turning point politically and socially.

b) Using Evidence — Effective Substantiation: 1 point
Specific examples (poll taxes, Plessy v. Ferguson, sharecroppers, second-class citizens, 40 acres and a mule) are used fully and effectively to substantiate the thesis that the amendments “had importance in mostly only name and symbolism.”
D. Synthesis: 1 point

The response effectively extends the thesis that the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments did not reach the potential originally set forth for them. It explicitly links and explains the long-term impacts of the amendments in the 20th century (the *Brown* decision, the Civil Rights Act of 1964, and the Voting Rights Act of 1965), which “solidified the promises from those two amendments.” Therefore, it addresses a development in a different historical period thoroughly.

Sample: 2B
Score: 5

A. Thesis: 1 point

The thesis presents a historically defensible claim that recognizes “a major change from the unequal treatment and discrimination that existed under the law” for African Americans (politics) and the changes to American society.

B. Argument Development: Using the Targeted Historical Thinking Skill: 2 points

a) Argument Development — Describes: 1 point

The response meets the standard of both describing and explaining the historical development both prior to and after the ratification of the amendments.

b) Argument Development — Explains: 1 point

The essay develops the argument with statements recognizing the change brought forth by the Fourteenth Amendment (“eliminated the debate that existed under the Dred Scott decision”) and the Fifteenth Amendment (“allowed African Americans to voice their concerns”). The essay also notes the walls that did not come down (“voting restrictions such as poll taxes and literacy tests in southern states where racist sentiment continued to exist”).

C. Argument Development: Using Evidence: 2 points

a) Using Evidence — Examples: 1 point

The response contains relevant evidence for its argument (for example, the *Dred Scott* decision, Jim Crow laws, Voting Rights Act of 1965, etc.).

b) Using Evidence — Effective Substantiation: 1 point

These specific examples are used effectively in a cause and effect fashion to suggest that the African American community took the negative aspects of the opposition to the amendments and later turned them into positive responses during the Civil Rights movement.

D. Synthesis: 0 points

Although there are several specific examples connecting the amendments to the Civil Rights movement and the 1960s, the response did not receive a synthesis point since this references an argument made in the thesis. The thesis paragraph makes the claim that the amendments led to future advancements for African Americans, so this is not an extension of the argument.
Sample: 2C
Score: 2

A. Thesis: 0 points

The thesis simply restates the question. Although the response does address extent, no historically defensible claim is made.

B. Argument Development: Using the Targeted Historical Thinking Skill: 1 point

a) Argument Development — Describes (1 point)
   The essay contains both before and after paragraphs in which developments from both time periods are clearly discussed.

b) Argument Development — Explains: 0 points
   The response mentions change in politics from being “dominated by anglo-saxons” to Black people holding office and playing a role in the election of President Grant. The response fails to mention any similarities. The response is largely descriptive and, consequently, did not earn an additional point.

C. Argument Development: Using Evidence: 1 point

a) Using Evidence — Examples: 1 point
   The response addresses the question with several specific examples, such as carpetbaggers, the role of Black people’s vote in Grant’s victory, the Freedmen’s Bureau, the grandfather clause, and poll taxes.

b) Using Evidence — Effective Substantiation: 0 points
   There is not a broad range of evidence paired with analysis to fully and effectively substantiate the contention that the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments were a major turning point in both politics and society.

D. Synthesis: 0 points

The response attempts to extend the argument to a different historical era (minorities playing a major role in politics in the current era and the current president being African American). Nonetheless, the connection is not sufficient to earn a point.