

AP[®] UNITED STATES HISTORY

2009 SCORING GUIDELINES (Form B)

Question 3

Analyze the political, economic, and religious tensions between immigrant Roman Catholics and native-born Protestants in the United States from the 1830s through the 1850s.

The 8–9 Essay

- Contains a clear, well-developed thesis assessing the political, economic, and religious tensions between immigrant Roman Catholics and native-born Protestants in the United States from the 1830s through the 1850s.
- Supports the thesis with substantial, relevant information concerning the political, economic, and religious tensions between immigrant Roman Catholics and native-born Protestants in the United States from the 1830s through the 1850s.
- Effectively analyzes the political, economic, and religious tensions between immigrant Roman Catholics and native-born Protestants in the United States from the 1830s through the 1850s.
- Effectively addresses all areas of the question, although there may be some minor imbalance in its treatment.
- Is well organized and well written.
- May contain minor errors.

The 5–7 Essay

- Contains a thesis, which may be partially developed, assessing the political, economic, and religious tensions between immigrant Roman Catholics and native-born Protestants in the United States from the 1830s through the 1850s.
- Provides some relevant information concerning the political, economic, and religious tensions between immigrant Roman Catholics and native-born Protestants in the United States from the 1830s through the 1850s.
- Provides some analysis of the political, economic, and religious tensions between immigrant Roman Catholics and native-born Protestants in the United States from the 1830s through the 1850s.
- Provides coverage of the question that may be imbalanced.
- Has acceptable organization and writing.
- May contain errors that do not seriously detract from the essay.

The 2–4 Essay

- Presents a thesis that is confused, simplistic, or undeveloped in terms of assessing the political, economic, and religious tensions between immigrant Roman Catholics and native-born Protestants in the United States from the 1830s through the 1850s.
- Includes little relevant information concerning the political, economic, and religious tensions between immigrant Roman Catholics and native-born Protestants in the United States from the 1830s through the 1850s.
- Has little analysis of the political, economic, and religious tensions between immigrant Roman Catholics and native-born Protestants in the United States from the 1830s through the 1850s.
- Provides coverage of the question that is superficial, descriptive, or seriously imbalanced; may cover only one tension or group.
- May be poorly organized and/or poorly written.
- May contain major errors.

AP[®] UNITED STATES HISTORY
2009 SCORING GUIDELINES (Form B)

Question 3 (continued)

The 0–1 Essay

- Lacks a thesis or restates the question.
- Includes no relevant information regarding the political, economic, and religious tensions between Catholics and native-born Protestants from the 1830s through the 1850s.
- Contains no analysis of the political, economic, and religious tensions.
- Is poorly organized and poorly written.
- May contain numerous errors, both major and minor.

The — Essay

- Is completely off topic or blank.

AP[®] UNITED STATES HISTORY

2009 SCORING GUIDELINES (Form B)

Question 3 Information List

Immigration—General

- 1820–1860: U.S. population grows from 10 million to 31 million.
- Immigration total was 4–5 million.
- Immigration population figures by year:
 - 1820s—150,000 immigrants
 - 1830s —600,000
 - 1840s —1.7 million
 - 1850s —2.3 million
- Volume of immigration (as a percentage of total population):
 - 1820s —1 percent
 - 1830s —4 percent
 - 1840s —15 percent; the highest proportional volume of immigration in U.S. history
- No fewer than 4.2 million immigrants over 1840–1860, and 3 million arrived between 1845 and 1855.
- About four in five of the 4.2 million immigrants from all nations who arrived from 1840 to 1860 settled in the New England and mid-Atlantic states.
- No federal legislation regulating immigration.
- New York, Chicago, and San Francisco were half immigrant; St. Louis was three-fifths immigrant in this period.
- Irish immigrants:
 - Approximately 50,000 in the United States in 1830s.
 - Great Famine of 1845–1851: Irish potato famine brought Irish immigrants.
 - 1840–1860: two million Irish men and women came into the United States.
 - Primarily settled in northeastern cities.
 - Avoided South because they opposed slavery, shunned Blacks, or feared competition from slave labor.
 - Characterized as “lawless and disruptive. In Ireland they had become accustomed to think of the law as a weapon of their enemy, the English landowners, and they brought this attitude to America. To the Irish, flouting the law was a manly activity” (Kelley, *Shaping of the American Past*).
 - Characterized as “tenaciously nationalistic and bitterly anti-British” (Faragher, *Out of Many*).
 - Faced not only employment discrimination but also persistent cultural denigration. It was common for newspapers of the time to caricature the Irish as monkeys, similar to the way cartoonists portrayed African Americans.

Tensions over Immigration

- 1834: Charlestown, Massachusetts, riot between Catholic and Protestant workers.
- 1844: Anti-Catholic riots in Philadelphia. Governor called out militia to protect Catholics after Catholic bishop persuaded public school officials to use both bibles. Incited by Native American Clubs. Lasted two months; two Catholic churches burned, 13 citizens killed, and 50 wounded.
- 1855: Riots in St. Louis, Baltimore, and Louisville showed streaks of nativism in South.
- 1855: “Lager Beer Riots” in Chicago over closing saloons on Sundays. Irish, Germans, and Swedes fought militia; ended with imposition of martial law.

AP[®] UNITED STATES HISTORY

2009 SCORING GUIDELINES (Form B)

Question 3 Information List (continued)

- In Cincinnati from 1846 to 1853, crime rate reportedly tripled. Murder reportedly up sevenfold. In Boston, expenditures for poor relief up three times over same period.
- New York City in 1860, 55 percent of those arrested for crimes were reportedly Irish.

Political Tensions

- Irish network of institutions: charitable societies, orphanages, militia companies, parochial schools, social clubs, and political organizations. Maintained identity and attained considerable political power.
- Fraternal lodges based on ethnicity included Irish Ancient Order of Hibernians.
- Foreign-born Boston voters (mostly Irish) increased 200 percent from 1850 to 1855.
- Cartoons of German beer kegs and Irish whiskey kegs stealing elections.
- Samuel F. B. Morse, author of *Foreign Conspiracy against the Liberties of the United States* (1834), argued Catholicism was a threat to the republic. Advocated an “Anti-Popery Union.” Republican-minded Protestants used this book in Sunday school.
- Pope Pius IX opposed republican reformers in Italy and called republicanism a false ideology based on sovereignty of people rather than sovereignty of God.
- Pope Pius X (1846–1878) reacted against secular liberalism and European uprisings of 1848.
- Catholic Archbishop John Hughes of New York attacked abolitionists, Free-Soilers, and Protestant reform movements as “Red Republicanism” of Europe. Hughes address (1850), “The Decline of Protestantism and Its Causes,” notes Catholic growth three times faster than Protestantism. “Protestantism is effete, powerless, dying out.”
- Protestants called for restricting public offices for native-born Americans.
- “Free School” political tickets created to defend public education.
- The Native American Association founded in 1837; became the Native American Party in 1845.
- Charles Allen organized the Order of Star-Spangled Banner in New York City in 1849.
- American Party (Know-Nothings):
 - Two secret fraternal societies of native-born Protestants merged in 1852: the Order of the Star-Spangled Banner and the Order of United Americans. By 1854 elections they became the American Party, or Know-Nothings. The party captured votes of Whig Party members who were not yet Republicans.
 - Membership by 1854 was between 800,000 and 1.5 million.
 - Did well in New England in 1855.
 - In 1854 won complete control in Massachusetts, capturing governorship, most of legislature, and entire congressional delegation; also won elections in Maryland, Kentucky, and Tennessee and polled at least 45 percent of vote in five other southern states and 40 percent of Pennsylvania vote.
 - Presidential candidate in 1856, Millard Fillmore, won 21 percent of popular vote and 8 electoral votes.
 - Declined for several reasons: Over 1855–56, noticeable decline in immigration; also conflict in Kansas, but most key was grassroots protest against professional politicians of Democrats and Whigs. Its spokesmen and elected officials were neither professional politicians nor established community leaders. Not able to make use of power. The Know-Nothings also did nothing. Voters looked elsewhere as issues changed.

AP[®] UNITED STATES HISTORY

2009 SCORING GUIDELINES (Form B)

Question 3 Information List (continued)

Economic Tensions

- Poorest immigrants were peasants and laborers from Ireland, who fled famine in 1840s caused by severe overpopulation, potato blight. No resources to buy farms.
- Immigrants settled in cities, taking low-skilled jobs in factories, construction, and labor, with long hours and low wages. Perceived as competition to others, edge to industrialists. In New York and Boston, formed nearly one-third of population by 1850.
- Illnesses:
 - Cholera, yellow fever, typhoid, diphtheria, tuberculosis.
 - 1849 cholera epidemics in New York, St. Louis, Cincinnati; 5,000 died in New York.
- Unemployed Protestant mechanics and poorly paid Protestant labor blamed immigrant labor; organized Native American Clubs. Called for extension of naturalization from 5 years to 21 years.
- Many Protestant laborers felt closer to Protestant owners than to Catholic labor.
- Catholic clergy and some Democrats in northeastern states wanted to reserve local taxes paid by Catholics for parochial schools.
- 1852: first Plenary Council of American Bishops decided to seek tax support for Catholic schools or tax relief for parents.
- Irish women were called “Biddies” (Bridgets) and Irish men “Paddies” (Patricks).
- As Irish entered police departments in big cities, the term “Paddy wagon” emerged as name for the wagon that hauled criminals to jail.
- Ethnic workers viewed temperance as business class meddling in their lives, while successful native-born workers tended to embrace the evangelical, middle-class ideology of temperance and self-help.

Religious Tensions

- 1820s: Second Great Awakening led by Evangelical Protestants.
- 1825: Burned Over District in upstate New York.
- Many Germans and most Irish were Catholic.
- 1840s: 16 Catholic dioceses and 700 Catholic churches existed in United States; by 1860, this had grown to 45 dioceses and 3,000 churches.
- 1840: Catholics ranked fifth in the United States in terms of members, behind the Baptists, Methodists, Presbyterians, and Congregationalists; by 1850, with some 1.8 million members, Catholics had the most members.
- Catholics resented Protestant domination of public education and use of King James Bible.
- Archbishop Hughes of New York City criticized public schools as purveyors of “Socialism, Red Republicanism, Universalism, Infidelity, Deism, Atheism, and Pantheism.”
- Protestants thought parochial schools undermined public schools.
- Evangelical ministers opposed Catholic theology.
- Temperance advocates were alarmed by Irish drinking.
- Beginning with Maine in 1851, 12 states enacted prohibition laws by 1855, and although many laws were weakened or repealed, they exacerbated tensions.
- For the first time Americans encountered the unfamiliar sight of priests and nuns in black garments on their streets. They also experienced the newcomers’ relaxed “Continental Sunday,” which turned the sober Protestant Sabbath into an exuberant day of visiting, picnicking, playing, and imbibing.

AP[®] UNITED STATES HISTORY
2009 SCORING GUIDELINES (Form B)

Question 3 Information List (continued)

- Catholics tended to place less emphasis on individual independence and more on communities created by family and church. Archbishop John Hughes said man was not an autonomous creature but “by his nature a being of society.” Thus Hughes was hostile to Protestant reform impulses that sinning behavior could be overcome by individuals.
- Authors posing as escaped nuns described secrets of the convents, including burial of babies. Maria Monk, *Awful Disclosures* (1836), sold 300,000 copies.

Circle the Section II question number you are answering on this page.

Mandatory 1	Part B — Circle one 2 or 3	Part C — Circle one 4 or 5
-----------------------	--------------------------------------	--------------------------------------

3 A
(1 of 3 pp)

During the 1830s through the 1850s, immigrants from the western and northern Europe, characterized by the Catholic Irish, came to America seeking more economic opportunities, political refugees, and a better social status. Suffered from the famine and poverty in their native countries, or the religious persecutions, these new immigrants added to the diversity in race to America, and created tensions with the native born Protestants. As the Roman Catholics continuously immigrated into America, the tensions existed as they participated more actively into the politics, created more competition against the Protestants for jobs, and practiced their Catholic religion which was regarded as a threat to the pure Protestant religion. As a result, discrimination, even violence took place as the Protestants showed their resentment against the newcomers who put a great threat on the original Protestant way of life.

The immigrants actively involved themselves into the American society, and participated actively in the realm of politics, despite their poverty; consequently, the native-born Protestants felt that their long-established sovereign political influence and political power got shared and disintegrated. The Roman Catholics who came into America, notably the Irish who suffered from the potato famine and religious persecution, were relatively poor and vulnerable. They tended to cluster in the eastern seaboard cities and felt constrained to get integrated into the actual American culture. Yet, the chance to participate in politics gave them new hope and a sense of belonging. As the native-born Protestants witnessed the increase in Catholic voters in their country, and the increase in influence from those "aliens" on the nation's politics, resentment and anti-foreign feeling surged. The Americans long enjoyed an elaborate freedom protected by the bill of rights,

Circle the Section II question number you are answering on this page.

3A

Mandatory 1	Part B — Circle one 2 or 3	Part C — Circle one 4 or 5
-----------------------	--------------------------------------	--------------------------------------

(2 of 3 pgs)

and could be easily traced back to the town meetings of the colonial time. However, as this sacred right and power in politics got shored, the native Americans felt more insecure and unrested.

The poverty-ridden immigrants in the 1830s to 1850s were eager to earn wealth and a better social status in the democratic America. The influx of these brave, innovative, and hardworking immigrants who were willing to do anything to gain economic wealth, put a great threat on the Protestants as they experienced more intense economic competition for jobs. The immigrants, though residing mostly in the minority areas, and were not started off with personal wealth, were willing to earn wealth and climb up the social ladder through hard work. In the 1800s, transportation system got more developed, and the industrialization of the nation provided more job opportunities. Yes, opportunities also brought fierce competition. The Roman Catholics were willing to work for low wages, thus putting more burdens and stress on the native-born Americans, as their wages got lowered consequently, and as their chances for getting rid of jobs got narrowed. Thus, a sense of resentment was built up, and the Americans became hostile, instead of friendly in accepting the new immigrants' culture and ways of behaviors.

Among the tensions between the immigrants and the native-borns, the most precipitatory one was religious conflict. The Catholic immigrants built Catholic churches and taught Catholic religion in the country, which aroused deep grudge among the Protestants who saw the Catholic religion as a threat and embarrassment to the sacred Christianity. As the new immigrants came to America, they continued to practice their Catholic religion. Catholic churches were built, and Catholic doctrines were introduced. These changes deeply concerned the religious Protestants, who regarded Christianity

Circle the Section II question number you are answering on this page.

Mandatory 1	Part B — Circle one 2 or (3)	Part C — Circle one 4 or 5
-----------------------	--	--------------------------------------

3A
(3 of 3 pages)

as the only sacred religion. As a result, the Know-Nothing Party was formed as an anti-foreign force to battle all the evils that the Roman Catholics brought in. The Christians viewed the Catholics' extravagant drinking, ostensible behaviors as horrific and debasing. The formation of the Know-Nothing Party further increased the tension between the immigrants and the Protestants.

The "Dark Forest" Era witnessed the influx of the Roman Catholic immigrants into America, seeking for economic wealth, religious refuge, and social stability. The coming of the immigrants, along with their participation in politics, competition for menial jobs, and their unchecked practice of religion aggravated and created resentment and discrimination within the nation. The Native-born Protestants, angered by the new comers' behaviors, created the Know-Nothing Party, and created a sense of nationalism that ultimately led to the strict immigration restrictions.

Circle the Section II question number you are answering on this page.

Mandatory 1	Part B — Circle one 2 or 3	Part C — Circle one 4 or 5
-----------------------	--------------------------------------	--------------------------------------

3B
(1 of 3)

The large influx of immigrants impacted American history from the very start. In particular, the arrival of Catholic Europeans ~~was especially~~ ~~effective~~ during the 1830s ~~to~~ 1850s caused several conflicts with native-born Protestants—religiously, economically, and politically.

Many immigrants who came to the United States had cultures in which the presence of drinking alcohol was ~~the~~ common. This directly contradicted the views of American Protestants, to whom drinking was a sin, and often led to attempts to outlaw or restrict ~~the~~ alcohol consumption. Various temperance movements, started ~~by~~ often by middle-class Protestants, targeted Catholic immigrant communities and set them apart as "outsiders" or "heathens." The Eighteenth ~~the~~ Amendment, outlawing the consumption ~~of~~ or sale of alcohol, further angered the immigrants who drank regularly or were in the alcohol business. These actions ~~and~~ ~~immigrant~~ ~~was~~ ~~of~~ ~~the~~ ~~needed~~ ~~to~~ ~~dispute~~ ~~and~~ ~~their~~ ~~religious~~ ~~beliefs~~ ~~concerning~~ ~~alcoholic~~ ~~beverages~~ ~~the~~ ~~of~~ ~~opposing~~ what immigrants saw as religiously acceptable tended to alienate immigrant communities and cause much tension ~~with~~ with the Protestant population.

Immigrants also affected the economic side of ~~the~~ ~~working~~ ~~class~~ ~~lives~~ the lives of the working class. The enormous numbers of immigrants corresponded to a decrease in the amount of available jobs in factories or industries as the newly arrived ~~the~~ foreigners took various low-paying jobs. This also angered the general lower-class public as a lack of jobs

Circle the Section II question number you are answering on this page.

Mandatory 1	Part B — Circle one 2 or 3	Part C — Circle one 4 or 5
----------------	-------------------------------	-------------------------------

3 B
(2 of 3)

meant less food for their families. The amount of available replacement workers among immigrant communities also made striking ineffective as immigrants could be immediately hired to take the place of the strikers. ~~Protestant~~ Protestant Americans forced to work in industrial jobs began to dislike and even hate immigrants for ruining prospects of better economic futures.

Finally, the immigrant population represented a large ~~political force~~ ~~in the American democratic system~~ political force in the American democratic system. Immigrants, through their sheer ~~voting~~ voting power, would be able to ~~influence~~ influence politics in ways benefiting their communities, that might be ~~contradictory~~ contradictory to Protestant movements or ideals. Immigrants ~~had~~ had the power to ~~push~~ push a representative of their interests into politics, and that representative would probably disagree with the views of other Protestant politicians. If enough ~~members of politics~~ ~~foreigners~~ foreigners became involved in politics, the chances of anti-immigration ~~legislation~~ ~~legislation~~ ~~or anti-alcohol legislation~~ ~~often supported by Protestants~~ ~~or anti-alcohol legislation~~ ~~often supported by Protestants~~ ~~coming into play~~ would decline. Thus, American Protestants, ~~often~~ often took measures to ensure foreigners did not gain too much power, ~~voting~~ voting against Catholic presidential candidate Al Smith, or passing Immigration laws to limit the arrival of new potential voters. ~~As a result of the heavy~~ ~~Catholic migration to the United States~~

Circle the Section II question number you are answering on this page.

Mandatory 1	Part B — Circle one 2 or (3)	Part C — Circle one 4 or 5
-----------------------	--	--------------------------------------

3B
(3 of 3)

The challenges facing immigrants in America were not limited to finding a place in an extremely different world. ~~They also had to deal with~~ ~~heavy tension from Protestant Americans~~ Catholic foreigners also faced heavy ~~the~~ opposition from Protestant, native-born Americans. Religiously, the Catholic acceptance of drinking fostered resentment from conservative ~~the~~ Protestants, economically, the new immigrants took over factory jobs, hurting ~~the~~ ^{the} chances of native-born workers improving their ~~status~~ economic status, and politically, immigrants represented potentially dangerous political power that could oppose Protestant politicians.

Circle the Section II question number you are answering on this page.

Mandatory 1	Part B — Circle one 2 or 3	Part C — Circle one 4 or 5
-----------------------	---	---

3C
(1 of 2 pgs)

Roman Catholics and native-born Protestants were a very different people group. Roman Catholics that immigrated to America were less superior to whites. They were discriminated against and less of a status ^{than} did native-born Protestants. They had less opportunities than native-born Protestants. All of these things led to tensions ~~in~~ between native-born Protestants and Roman Catholics.

In the political arena, Roman Catholics didn't have a very big role. They didn't have as many opportunities for education as ~~they~~ those who were born in America. They were deemed uneducated and didn't have as much of a chance in politics ^c as others did. Native-born Protestants on the other hand, had greater opportunities in politics because of their education. They felt they were superior to Roman Catholics based on this feeling. Because of this feeling, there was a lot of tension between the two.

In the area of economic opportunity, Roman Catholics still did not fare well. They started out poorer and had no rank to gain good jobs. They were looked upon as worthless and uneducated and ~~didn't~~ ^{couldn't} get high paying jobs. As they were uneducated and couldn't understand English as well, bosses took advantage of their workers, sometimes even kidnapping them. Native-born Protestants had a better status and ~~a~~ could get better jobs. Because they had more education and could speak better English, they moved up faster in the

Circle the Section II question number you are answering on this page.

3C
(2 of 2 pgs)

Mandatory 1	Part B — Circle one 2 or 3	Part C — Circle one 4 or 5
-----------------------	--------------------------------------	--------------------------------------

work place - to the envy of all Roman Catholics.

Roman Catholics and native-born Protestants had different religious thoughts about when any two groups wanting to come out on top have different religious ideals, there is bound to be a conflict. Catholics worship Mary as well as Jesus and don't like any group that says otherwise. Protestants don't worship Mary, only Jesus and don't like any ~~like any~~ group that believes differently. When two groups have conflicting religious ideals this big, it is close impossible to live in harmony.

As seen, the Roman Catholics and native-born Protestants didn't get along in three areas. Political, economic and religious were those three. Because Catholics were less educated than Protestants they had a harder time in politics as well as in economic areas.

AP[®] UNITED STATES HISTORY
2009 SCORING COMMENTARY (Form B)

Question 3

Sample: 3A

Score: 8

This essay contains a clear, well-constructed thesis that assesses the political, economic, and religious tensions between the immigrant Roman Catholics (Irish) and native-born Protestants in the United States from the 1830s through the 1850s. It supports the thesis with relevant information to analyze the rising tensions between the groups, including political elements (Bill of Rights, freedom of religion, elections), economic factors (competition for transportation and industrial jobs), and religious elements (Catholic churches, theological doctrine, Protestant nativism). The essay is especially effective in analyzing tensions in all three areas as contributing to the creation of the Know-Nothing Party. This sophistication, coupled with a strong conclusion, lifted the essay to the high category. The essay is well organized and well written.

Sample: 3B

Score: 5

This essay has a well-developed thesis and is well organized and well written. In the area of religious tension, it recognizes temperance as a topic of conflict. In the economic area, it acknowledges the impact of immigrant labor taking jobs and driving wages down, and in the political area, it recognizes the united effort of the immigrant community to act as a voting bloc to benefit its own community. The overall strengths of the thesis—organization, effective information, and analysis—placed the essay in the 5–7 score category. But the errors that incorrectly mention the Eighteenth Amendment and Al Smith kept the essay at the bottom of the category.

Sample: 3C

Score: 3

This essay presents a simplistic and underdeveloped thesis. The three areas of tension are present but are treated in a superficial manner. There is some incorrect analysis, such as the statement that “Roman Catholics didn’t have a very big role” in politics. The essay is substantive enough to have qualified for the middle of the 2–4 score category but not sufficient in analysis and information to have been scored at the top of the category.