Question 5

Analyze the factors that prevented the development of a unified German state in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries.

8–9 Points
- Thesis must include reference to at least three factors (a factor can be an event, like the posting of the 95 Theses or the Thirty Years' War).
- Organization is clear, consistently followed, and effective in support of the argument.
- Essay is well balanced; at least three factors are discussed and analyzed (even briefly).
- Three factors in the essay are supported by multiple pieces of specific evidence.
- Must refer to factors in both centuries (may even go beyond 1648).
- Contains no major errors; may contain minor errors that do not detract from the argument. (It is a major error to say that the Peace of Augsburg ended the Thirty Years' War; however, this is a minor error if the essay later appropriately places the war in the seventeenth century. Another major error is asserting that Germany was a multiethnic state when the phrase is used in a nineteenth- and twentieth-century sense, and especially when groups such as Serbians and Italians are named.)

6–7 Points
- Thesis must include reference to at least two factors.
- Organization is clear, effective in support of the argument, but not consistently followed.
- Essay is balanced; at least two factors are discussed and analyzed.
- At least two factors in the essay are supported by at least one piece of specific evidence.
- Refers to factors in both centuries (may even go beyond 1648).
- May contain one major error or several minor errors that detract from the argument.

4–5 Points
- May contain an explicit thesis that refers to only two factors or one that is not fully responsive to the question. (An essay in this range may also have a strong thesis with three factors.)
- Organization is apparent but is ineffective or inconsistently followed.
- Essay shows some imbalance; facts are listed rather than analyzed.
- Most of the major factors in the essay are supported by at least one piece of relevant (possibly generalized) evidence.
- May refer to factors in only one century.
- May contain errors or misleading overgeneralizations that detract from the argument.

2–3 Points
- May contain a weak or invalid thesis or a thesis that merely repeats/paraphrases the prompt.
- Organization is unclear and ineffective.
- Essay shows serious imbalance, most factors that could be discussed are neglected or treated cursorily.
- The essay lists rather than analyzes factors.
- Only one or two factors are supported by relevant evidence.
- May contain several errors that detract from the argument.
0–1 Point

- No discernable attempt at a thesis.
- Little or no discernable organization.
- One or none of the major factors that could be discussed is mentioned.
- Little or no supporting evidence used.
- May contain numerous errors that detract from the argument.
This is a straightforward, mainstream question. The necessary information is covered in all the standard textbooks, although it is usually broken into several sections: the Reformation, religious warfare in the sixteenth century, Thirty Years’ War, early modern absolutism, the wars initiated by France, and the rise of Brandenburg-Prussia. The information needed to answer this question is by no means obscure, but the question does require students to assemble a response from different sections of the textbook. Below are the factors students could discuss. Although these factors are grouped, each group is not a factor—so a student could discuss two political factors or two religious factors, and each would be counted separately.

**Political:** The Holy Roman Emperor (HRE; Charles V will appear most often) was a weak monarch, thanks to the fact of his being elected and not controlling a strong army or administrator; Germans lived in approximately 300 small principalities, duchies, princedoms, and independent cities that were only weakly unified under the HRE; German rulers did not want to submit to a strong ruler; after 1648, Prussia began to be transformed into an absolutist, more powerful state; Germany’s problems were complicated by the fact that the HRE also ruled Spain and had to deal with other problems, including the Ottoman Empire. Some students might note that, beginning with the reign of Frederick William, the Great Elector of Brandenburg Prussia (1640–88), the long-term foundations of German unity in the nineteenth century were laid, as Frederick William effectively used the techniques of absolutism.

**Religious:** Luther challenged the HRE’s religious as well as political power; Protestantism supports keeping power fragmented within the numerous principalities; several different forms of Christianity, especially Calvinism, limit unity in a world where each state must share a religion; Calvinism also threatens any state’s political power because it seeks theocracy. Anabaptists were based in Moravia after their persecution following the Peasants’ Wars. Religious conflicts led to military conflicts: see below.

**Military:** German wars of religion divide Germans among themselves (1524-55; Peasants’ War, 1524-25; Schmalkaldic Wars, 1546-55); foreign powers (France, Ottoman Empire) intervened. These wars were settled by the Peace of Augsburg, which reinforced the power of princes by allowing them to choose the religion of their realm (*cuius regio, eius religio*). The Thirty Years’ War, which began with the rebellion against Ferdinand Habsburg (who became HRE in 1619) in May 1618 (the Defenestration of Prague) ultimately decimated the population through disease, famine, and combat. In 1600, the population of Germany was 15 million; in 1650 it was 11 million. This period of warfare was also characterized by foreign involvement: Denmark, Sweden, and France. The Thirty Years’ War was ended by the series of agreements known as the Treaty of Westphalia (1648), which decisively limited the political, military, and diplomatic powers of the HRE. In particular, the German states of Bavaria and Brandenburg emerged as strong counterweights to the HRE. Louis XIV’s wars kept much of German Europe in costly fighting through the War of Spanish Succession (1701-13).

**Economic:** Many principalities made economic growth slower because of trade barriers, different coinage and so forth; opening of the Atlantic moved trade away from cities on the Baltic and slowed the economy; Treaty of Westphalia hurt the economy of all Germany by giving control of mouths of rivers to Holland and Sweden.

**Social/Cultural:** Linguistic and cultural differences (which some students overstate, making Germany “multiethnic”); Germans had a local rather than a “German” identity until the development of nationalism in the late Enlightenment and early Romantic era; no one state is big enough and strong enough to provide the nucleus of a new state until after the Treaty of Utrecht in 1714, which “upgrades” Prussia to a kingdom.
Geographical: German was made up of several hundred territorial states: princely states, ecclesiastical principalities, free imperial cities. They owed loyalty to the HRE, but had a great deal of independence.

Important Dates

1517: Luther posts his 95 Theses
1524-25: Peasants’ War
1529: Marburg Colloquy (Luther–Zwingli debates on the Eucharist)
1530: Diet of Augsburg
1546-55: Schmalkaldic Wars (ended by the Peace of Augsburg)
1555: Peace of Augsburg
1556: Abdication of Charles V
1617: Archduke Frederick Habsburg elected king of Bohemia
1618: Defenestration of Prague
1618-25: Bohemian phase of the Thirty Years’ War
1625-29: Danish phase of the Thirty Years’ War
1630-35: Swedish phase of the Thirty Years’ War
1635-48: Franco–Swedish phase of the Thirty Years’ War
1640-88: Reign of Frederick William, the Great Elector of Brandenburg Prussia
1648: Peace of Westphalia
1688: Accession of Frederick as elector of Prussia; becomes king of Prussia in 1701
1688-97: War of the League of Augsburg/War of the Grand Alliance begins with the French attack on the Palatinate
The Holy Roman Empire was the most powerful

kingdom during the Middle Ages. But as time drew
to a close many factors arose that prevented it from
becoming a unified German state. The Reformation broke
gentil the kingdom religiously, the Thirty Years War devastated
the land and economy and weak leadership among the Holy
Roman Emperors all contributed to its lack of unification.

The Reformation began when Martin Luther attacked
the church for faults in its doctrine. His protest led
to the rise of a brand new religion. The princes in
the German states saw this as an opportunity to
become more independent. Religious wars raged between
Catholic and Lutheran princes. Charles V, the Holy Roman
Emperor was distracted by other affairs and was unable
to suppress the Lutherans. These religious wars ended with
the Peace of Augsburg. This allowed the princes to choose
which religion was practiced in their territory. This caused
a deep and lasting rift between the German states that
went much farther than political differences.

Another factor that prevented the formation of
a unified German state was the Thirty Years War. This began
as the Calvinist population in the Helbo tried to become
recognized officially. This led to more internal religious
wars but eventually encompassed major foreign powers
as well. By the end of the Thirty Years War, none of
the German States were still participating but a

bitter war was being fought on their soil. French and

Swedish armies marched throughout the States. As a

result of this, many civilians died and the agriculture was

destroyed utterly. This intense period of war and the

destruction of the economy forced the German States to

worry about recovering individually and prevented them

from even thinking of unifying.

A third factor preventing unification of the

German States was a significant lack of leadership. To

start with the Emperor was elected to the throne. This

resulted in weak leaders being appointed so that the

electors could have more power. The Emperor was

in theory just a figurehead and had little to no influence

in the affairs of Germany. Also no single state held

influence over other states. While there were the

seven elector states they disagreed often. This

necessary leadership was also not possible due to the lack

of centralized authority even within the States. Unification

was not possible until a political power house such as

Prussia or Austria rose to power to force unification.

In conclusion unification of the German state

was prevented by the religious differences caused by

the Reformation, the economic devastation of the Thirty

Years War and a lack of strong leadership.
within the German States.
The unification of Germany was promoted by many factors. These were various states that had come out of the Holy Roman Empire during this time. They were unable to unify because differing religious individual princes wanting to keep powers.

The peace of Augsburg (1555) made it agreed throughout the Holy Roman Empire that the prince of a state may have his particular religion and the rest of state would be inclined to follow that religion. This meant that throughout the time, there was no religious unity which made political unification that much harder. Mostly, Southern German states remained Catholic and the Northern ones became Protestant. Although at the time, there was no war between them, disputes between religion prevented the development of a unified Germany.

The German states were run by princes who liked the idea of ruling and keeping their power. There was no way that they were going to let a unified German state arise at the cost of them being in control of their own regions. On the other hand, small individual states also meant that there was no one region strong enough to unite Germany. There could be no war held by one state that would end up conquering the rest of the state. This prevented Germany
From unifying German states could not unify because of their already existing differences and lack of motivation to become united. The different states of Germany had no religious unity which only made the process of unifying Germany harder. On top of that, German princes would rather have kept separation than unity.
During the broken reign of the Holy Roman Empire, no strong centralized form of government existed. The Germanic States existed as separate governments with no desire to give up power and the central idea for a government could be reached made the development of a unified Germany impossible.

During Charles V's reign, the Holy Roman Empire experienced the Protestant Reformation, devastating his Empire in the Peace of Augsburg (1555). Eventually his possessions were split, and German states embraced provincial power. By the Peace of Westphalia the HRE was more or less completely decentralized. Philip II tried the Catholic Reformation but no centralization resulted. This massive disunity for centuries made the unification of Germany impossible because giving up power under one was in itself impossible.

The Revolutions in 1848 proved unsuccessful around Europe, including Germany. The romantic idea of nationalism and Johann Herder's idea of the Volkgeist gave reason to construct a unified Germany. One nation with one ideology was what the Germanic States desired. King Frederick William IV condemned the unification of Germany, for he would not accept a crown from the gutter. The parliament of Nuremberg proposed the Germanic Reich plan for a unified
Germany, but FWIII refused to accept the crown in the end. He disowned the German states at their attempts to unify and would furthermore not be king of Germany.

The unification of Germany was an impossible task during the 16th/17th centuries because the acceptance of one form of government and one leader was impossible. Provincial rule was at stake, and the noble class issued no desire to give up their power. The 16th/17th centuries in Germany were times of religious wars and disparity. Religion split the Holy Roman Empire in half and after it remained decentralized even after religious toleration was accepted. A central form of government and power was needed, and that is what the German states ideally lacked.
Overview

This question required students to choose and analyze at least two factors of any type that prevented the development of a unified German state in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. It allowed them to discuss a wide range of influences—political, economic, social, military, religious, and geopolitical. They needed to select broad issues, evaluate them, and support them with specific historical events.

Sample: 5A
Score: 9

This essay has all the hallmarks of a strong response. It provides persuasive, evidence-based analysis of three factors, and it covers both centuries. Although it has a few (allowable) minor errors—for example, the Holy Roman Emperor was a “figurehead”—this essay rises above a score of 8 because it offers a credible, well-analyzed thesis, supports it with solid evidence, and presents a clear argument.

Sample: 5B
Score: 5

This essay discusses only two factors: religious disunity and political disunity. There is little specific evidence for the latter claim, and only the sixteenth century is clearly referenced. These inadequacies keep it from earning a score of 6. The student makes some good use of evidence and provides some analysis of the religious factor, however, which raises the response above the 4 level.

Sample: 5C
Score: 3

This essay has a thesis that deals with only two factors—the multitude of states and the lack of a strong central government. The second paragraph describes simply the religious and political divisions and concludes with a very brief analysis. The third paragraph is off topic. These flaws, and the fact that the supporting evidence is thin and not always valid, bar the essay from achieving a score of 4. It rises above a score of 2 because the student makes some attempt at describing the relevant factors and analyzing their impact.